

ABSTRACT

Maharani, Anak Agung Putri (2012), *The Effect of Reciprocal Teaching and Self-Concept upon the Reading Comprehension of the Tenth Grade Students of SMA Negeri 1 Gianyar*. Thesis. Language Education Study Program, Postgraduate Program, Ganesha University of Education.

This thesis has been approved and corrected by:

Supervisor I : Prof.Dr. A.A. Istri Ngurah Marhaeni, M.A.

Supervisor II : Dra. Luh Putu Artini, M.A., Ph.D.

Keywords: reading comprehension, reciprocal teaching, self-concept.

This study aimed at: a) investigating the significant difference in reading comprehension between the students who are taught by using reciprocal teaching and those who are taught by using conventional teaching; b) investigating the interactional effect between teaching methods and self-concept upon students' reading comprehension; c) investigating the significant difference in reading comprehension between the students with high self-concept who are taught by reciprocal teaching and those who are taught by conventional teaching; and d) investigating the significant difference in reading comprehension between the students with low self-concept who are taught by reciprocal teaching and those who are taught by conventional teaching. It was an experimental study by making use posttest-only control group with 2 x 2 factorial design. The population of the study was 240 tenth grade students of SMA Negeri 1 Gianyar in the academic year 2011/2012 wherein 80 students were chosen as the sample through Cluster Random Sampling. The research data were collected through a self-concept questionnaire and a reading comprehension test and were analyzed by using Two-Way Anova and Tukey test. The results discovered that, first, the students who were treated by reciprocal teaching obtained better reading comprehension than those who were treated by conventional teaching; second, there was an interactional effect between teaching methods and self-concept upon the students' reading comprehension; third, the students with high-self concept obtained higher reading comprehension when they were treated by reciprocal teaching than by conventional teaching; and fourth, the students with low self-concept attained higher reading comprehension when they were treated by conventional teaching than by reciprocal teaching.

ABSTRAK

Maharani, Anak Agung Putri (2012). Pengaruh Penggunaan Pengajaran Resiprokal dan Konsep Diri terhadap Pemahaman Membaca Siswa Kelas X di SMA Negeri 1 Gianyar. Tesis. Program Studi Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris, Program Pascasarjana, Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha.

Tesis ini telah disetujui dan dikoreksi oleh:

Pembimbing I : Prof. Dr. A.A. Istri Ngurah Marhaeni, M. A.

Pembimbing II : Dra. Luh Putu Artini, M.A. Ph.D.

Kata Kunci: pemahaman membaca, pengajaran resiprokal, konsep diri

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk: a) mengetahui perbedaan signifikan pada pemahaman membaca di antara siswa yang diajar dengan pengajaran resiprokal dan siswa yang diajar dengan pengajaran konvensional; b) mengetahui efek interaksi yang terjadi di antara pengajaran resiprokal dan konvensional dengan konsep diri terhadap pemahaman membaca siswa; c) mengetahui perbedaan signifikan pada pemahaman membaca di antara siswa berkonsep diri tinggi yang mengikuti pengajaran resiprokal dan yang mengikuti pengajaran konvensional; dan d) mengetahui perbedaan signifikan pada pemahaman membaca siswa berkonsep diri rendah yang mengikuti pengajaran resiprokal dan yang mengikuti pengajaran konvensional. Studi eksperimen ini menggunakan rancangan penelitian *posttest-only control group design* dengan faktorial 2x2. Populasi penelitian berjumlah 240 siswa kelas X di SMA Negeri 1 Gianyar pada tahun ajaran 2011/2012 yang mana 80 siswa dipilih sebagai sampel dengan penyampelan acak *cluster*. Data penelitian dikumpulkan dengan menggunakan kuesioner konsep diri serta tes pemahaman membaca dan kemudian dianalisis menggunakan Anova dua jalur yang diikuti dengan tes Tukey. Adapun temuan-temuan penelitian ini yaitu: pertama, siswa yang mengikuti pengajaran resiprokal meraih pemahaman membaca yang lebih baik daripada siswa yang mengikuti pengajaran konvensional; kedua, terdapat efek interaksi di antara pengajaran resiprokal dan pengajaran konvensional dengan konsep diri terhadap pemahaman membaca siswa; ketiga, siswa berkonsep diri tinggi yang diajar dengan pengajaran resiprokal meraih pemahaman membaca yang lebih baik daripada siswa yang diajar dengan pengajaran konvensional; dan keempat, siswa berkonsep diri rendah yang diajar dengan pengajaran konvensional meraih pemahaman membaca yang lebih baik daripada siswa yang diajar dengan pengajaran resiprokal.

INTRODUCTION

Background of Study

School-Based Curriculum (SBC) which is formally implemented in Indonesian education strongly encourages the teaching of four language skills in the field of language teaching such as reading, speaking, listening, and writing. Moats (1999: 5) as cited in Westwood (2008: 2) remarks that reading is the fundamental skill upon which all formal education depends. Through reading, students' knowledge will automatically be enriched which eventually can influence their language skills, such as speaking, listening, and writing. Its main purposes are for learning, garnering information and enjoyment which are achieved when readers comprehend what they read.

Ironically, the common phenomena happened in EFL reading is instructor's disappointment in students' comprehension of the assigned readings. When reading in a foreign language, readers have an access to their first language (L1) and often use their L1 as a reading strategy. But, frequently, it takes time and builds confusion among students. They often encounter many new and difficult words and are not able to catch the main idea of the text. Then, they will be reluctant to continue reading because of unsuccessful comprehension.

The problem is again a matter of the teaching method employed by the teachers at that school in their daily teaching. In common practice, some teachers tend to emphasize theoretical content and neglect training of any skills. Many students are accustomed with being spoon-fed rather than being independent readers and using their skills or reading strategies optimally. To cover these problems, a cooperative teaching method was offered namely reciprocal teaching. It leads students to respectively follow four comprehension strategies such as predicting, questioning, summarizing, and clarifying. The shift from a teacher to a student is a central component of the reciprocal teaching process which encourages self-regulation on the part of student.

However, students' comprehension on a text is not only influenced by how great a teaching method in fostering comprehension but also other factors. Based on Burns, Roe, and Ross (1996: 14), self-concept, known as one of influential affective factors to the reading process, affects how hard students will work at the

reading task. Students who have early self-concept problem in reading skill often have diminished opportunities to engage in reading and related activities. Burns, Roe, and Ross (1996: 16) stated that students with poor opinions of themselves are probably afraid to do a reading task because their belief of their inability to succeed. They are sure that they will fail. The early identification of students with poor reading performance and low self-concept is essential before these become entrenched patterns of reading difficulty.

With regard to the importance of reading skill for EFL students, their self-concept that they bring with them in the years of schooling, and the problems faced in comprehending English texts, the researcher has accomplished a research about the effect of reciprocal teaching and self-concept upon students' reading comprehension.

Research Questions

The research questions of this study can be formulated as follows:

- a. Is there any significant difference in reading comprehension between the students who are taught by reciprocal teaching and those who are taught by conventional teaching?
- b. Is there any interactional effect between teaching methods and self-concept upon students' reading comprehension?
- c. Is there any significant difference in reading comprehension between the students with high self-concept who are taught by reciprocal teaching and those who are taught by conventional teaching?
- d. Is there any significant difference in reading comprehension between the students with low self-concept who are taught by reciprocal teaching and those who are taught by conventional teaching?

Research Objectives

- a. To investigate whether there is any significant difference in reading comprehension between the students who are taught by reciprocal teaching and those who are taught by conventional teaching.
- b. To investigate whether there is any interactional effect between teaching methods and self-concept upon students' reading comprehension.

- c. To investigate whether there is any significant difference in reading comprehension between the students with high self-concept who are taught by reciprocal teaching and those who are taught by conventional teaching.
- d. To investigate whether there is any significant difference in reading comprehension between the students with low self-concept who are taught by reciprocal teaching and those who are taught by conventional teaching.

Significance of Study

The significance of this research is divided into two significances. First, theoretical significances deal with education in general or with the policy decision in education. Second, practical significances are related to education in specific area (e.g. schools) or it is in conjunction with the process of teaching and learning.

a. Theoretical Significance

- 1) The research findings are supposed to enrich and generate useful knowledge and understanding on the effect of reciprocal teaching and self-concept upon students' reading comprehension.
- 2) The research findings are supposed to provide solutions of the education problems, especially, in teaching English reading comprehension in senior high schools. The significance of the study lies in its attempt to find a suitable instructional method to aid Indonesian high-school students in enriching their reading comprehension. If it is found that reciprocal teaching has a good effect on students' reading comprehension, this research intends to assist them in their realization of the benefits of using reading strategies, of the kind of strategies available to them, and of the way to use them. Besides, this research also attempts at answering the effect of self-concept as an influential affective factor upon students' reading comprehension. Therefore, the research findings intend to assist the teacher as well as the students to consider this factor and greatly enhance it.
- 3) This study is intended to give beneficial contribution to Indonesian education policy's enhancement. If the finding reveals that reciprocal teaching affects the students' reading comprehension, the paradigm of teaching must rely on constructivism. The students are directed to actively construct their own

learning as nowadays Indonesian education prepares the students to survive in real life through meaningful learning.

b. Practical Significance

Practically, the results of this study are supposed to bring beneficial influences for the following sides:

1) Teachers

This study is expected to enrich teacher's ways of teaching and to provide an initial guide and inspiration to assist teachers to develop their own understandings of their students and the self-concept the students bring with them to foreign language learning.

2) Students

This study is mainly intended to give meaningful contribution to the students' achievement. Reciprocal teaching hopefully can help students to be active in the class, to develop their reading comprehension. Moreover, this study will provide richer, more nuanced data that can reveal more of the complexity and help elucidate any potential variation of students themselves.

3) Other researchers

This study is expected to be an alternative source for other researchers who will conduct a similar field of study.

Limitation of Study

This experimental study was restricted on investigation of the effect of reciprocal teaching and self-concept upon reading comprehension in learning English. It was also restricted on investigating the interactional effect between teaching methods (reciprocal teaching and conventional teaching) and also self-concept upon students' English reading comprehension. It was continued by investigating whether this interactional effect affects students' English reading comprehension. The research was conducted in SMA Negeri 1 Gianyar particularly at the second semester of tenth graders in the academic year 2011/2012. The research sample was categorized into the students with high self-

concept and the students with low self-concept who were treated by using reciprocal teaching which was compared to conventional teaching.

RESEARCH METHODS

This study was conducted at the second semester of the tenth grade students in SMA Negeri 1 Gianyar. As the sample, 80 students were selected. The research made use a *Posttest Only Control-Group Design* using a 2x2 factorial arrangement. For the data collector instrument, reading comprehension test in the form of multiple choice and self-concept questionnaire were administered. The multiple choice type test was composed by 40 five-option items covering narrative, descriptive and news item genres. The questionnaire was made into likert scale with 5 options. The Piers-Harris' self-concept questionnaire was adapted in which 81 items were administered to the research sample. Meanwhile, for the treatment instruments, lesson plans and teaching handout were used. The data collector instruments were firstly tried out and it was estimated that the instruments were reliable and valid. The gained data were analyzed by Two-Way Anova and Tukey test which were assisted by SPSS 16.0.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Data Description

Data descriptions of the central tendency (median, mean, and mode) and the spread of dispersion (standard deviation, variance, range, minimum, and maximum) of the eight groups of data (A1, A2, B1, B2, A1B1, A2B1, A1B2, A2B2) were presented in table 3.1.

Table 3.1 The Summary of the Calculation of Central Tendency and Dispersion

Statistics	Group							
	A1	A2	B1	B2	A1B1	A2B1	A1B2	A2B2
Mean	77.87	74.75	79.68	72.94	85.25	74.12	70.50	75.38
Median	80	72.50	82.50	72.50	85	73.75	71.25	72.50
Mode	80	82.50	82.50	72.50	80	82.5	72.50	70
Std. Deviation	9.96	7.29	9.22	7.00	5.73	8.75	7.50	5.63
Variance	99.21	53.14	84.99	49.00	32.83	76.49	56.32	31.76
Range	40	25	35	30	20	25	30	17.50
Minimum	55	60	60	55	75	60	55	67.50
Maximum	95	85	95	85	95	85	85	85

Hypothesis Testing

Before executing the hypothesis testing, two prerequisite tests had been accomplished. It was discovered that all gained data were normal and homogeneous. The hypothesis testing was subsequently done which resulted on rejecting the four null hypotheses or accepting the four alternative hypotheses.

Discussion

Based on the first hypothesis testing, it was discovered that the main effect from teaching method significantly affects the students' reading comprehension. It was proven by the calculation result of two-way Anova that the value of F_A is 4.015 and the value of F_{cv} is 3.967 in which $F_{ob} > F_{cv}$, so H_0 was rejected and H_1 was accepted. Further, it was estimated that the mean score of the students who were taught by reciprocal teaching (\bar{X}_{A1}) was 77.87 while the mean score of the students who were taught by conventional teaching (\bar{X}_{A2}) was 74.75. These findings denoted that the participants in the experimental group achieved better in reading comprehension after being taught through reciprocal teaching.

Reciprocal teaching emphasizes on cognitive-constructivist and sociocultural point of views (Klingner, Vaughn, and Boardman, 2007:131 and Choo, Eng, and Ahmad, 2011). To comprehend, readers have to use their prior knowledge to give meaning to the text. Besides, it is done through discussion since learning is viewed as quintessentially social. Teachers and students exchange their roles during study. As teachers, they shift their role from the transmitters of knowledge to the mediator of thinking. The responsibility of strategy application gradually turns over to the students when they are capable. It leads students to think about their reading process, develop a plan of action, monitor their own reading in order to construct their own knowledge, and self-evaluate their reading process which finally build a great comprehension. The four key strategies increased the awareness of the students' own thinking and reading process.

Palincar and Brown (1984: 168) stated that the instruction provided during the reciprocal teaching sessions involved extensive modeling and practice in four strategies that were deemed to be ideal comprehension-fostering and

comprehension-monitoring activities. It means that the method provides a dual function, that of enhancing comprehension through practicing the four steps extensively and at the same time affording an opportunity for the student to check and monitor their comprehension.

In investigating the interactional effect between the implementation of teaching methods in relation to self-concept toward the students' reading comprehension, the second hypothesis testing was done. The finding resulted on rejecting the null hypothesis or, in other words, the alternative hypothesis was accepted which stated that there is a significant interactional effect between teaching methods and self-concept upon the students' reading comprehension. It was proven by the calculation results administered by two-way Anova that the value of F_{AB} is 25.733 which is higher than the value of F_{cv} that is 3.967. It can be drawn a conclusion that besides teaching methods applied, reading comprehension of the tenth grade students of SMA Negeri 1 Gianyar was influenced by their self-concept which is considered as one of the internal factors of the students in learning.

For the students who had high self-concept, there is a significant difference between those who were taught by reciprocal teaching and those who were taught by conventional teaching. The mean score of the students' reading comprehension taught by reciprocal teaching ($\bar{X}_{A1B1} = 85.25$) was higher than the mean score of the students' reading comprehension taught by conventional teaching ($\bar{X}_{A2B1} = 74.12$) which denoted that those who were taught by reciprocal teaching achieved better than those who were taught by conventional teaching. The difference between those two groups also can be seen on the Tukey test of 7.09 which is considered significant because it is higher than the Q_{cv} of 2.96.

Burns, Roe, and Ross (1996: 17) asserted that readers with high self-concept are generally not afraid to attack a reading task, since they believe they are going to succeed. Reciprocal teaching which fosters students to be actively involved in a social interaction to construct meaning will work best with the students who perceive themselves positively and confidently. The students with high self-concept are confident with and believe in their capabilities to solve problems and tasks they face. They tend to succeed and pursue their goals even

when obstacles arise. In other words, the students with high self-concept are motivated to produce good performance if confronting challenging environment as what reciprocal teaching offers. In accordance with the nature of reciprocal teaching and high self-concept's characteristics, reciprocal teaching benefits and suits the students with high self-concept in comprehending texts.

It was supported by the findings from Berry and West; Bouffard-Bouchard and Pinard; Harter in Dowson, et. al. (2003) that the students with positive self-perception preserve when confronted with challenging tasks and eventually succeed. The challenges were seen as opportunities to improve. Likewise, Mastiny (2011) discovered that the students with high self-concept were able to put their maximum effort to produce a good performance. They also tended to willingly evaluate themselves based on the feedback given by peers or the teacher. These findings denoted that the students with high self-concept comfortably learn within challenging classroom which provides social interaction as what reciprocal teaching offers.

In contrast, the students who had high self-concept and were taught by conventional teaching could not achieve well. It is mainly caused by the students' strong believe over their capabilities but do not have any chances to perform their actual knowledge which lead them to undervalue the reading process. The students with high level of self-concept are completely equipped in doing the given tasks to obtain the satisfactory or best accomplishment. They also preserve when confronted with challenging tasks (Berry and West, Bouffard, Bouffard-Buchard and Pinard, Harter in Dowson, et.al, 2003). But non threatening environment provided by the conventional teaching lead them complete the reading activity effortless, spend less time on the activity, and finally escort poor comprehension.

For the students who had low self-concept, there is a significant difference between those who were taught by reciprocal teaching and those who were taught by conventional teaching. The mean score of the students' reading comprehension taught by reciprocal teaching ($\bar{X}_{A1B2} = 70.50$) was smaller than the mean score of the students' reading comprehension taught by conventional teaching ($\bar{X}_{A2B2} = 75.38$) which revealed that the students with low self-concept achieved better in

reading comprehension after being treated by conventional teaching than by reciprocal teaching. The difference can also be seen on the Tukey test of 3.10 which is considered significant because it is higher than the Q_{cv} of 2.96.

As argued by Burns, Roe, and Ross (1996: 17), children with poor self-concept are afraid to attempt a reading task because they are sure they will fail. Findings of Philips (as cited in Guay, Marsh, and Bolvin, 2003) found that the students with low self-concept had low persistence toward their learning. They tend to avoid taking risks and show reluctant attitudes to spend effort to comprehend a text. As Rasmiathi (2010) discovered that the students with low self-concept kept silent while undergoing cooperative learning environment. Open dialogue is avoided as the students with low self-concept reluctantly on speaking up. Therefore, the students with low self-concept are more secure with a static condition in which they are situated as recipients of information. The students with low self-concept feel at ease with the conventional teaching as they passively involve in learning. They will be able to reach their best in reading if they are treated by conventional teaching.

In accordance with the prior elucidation, it can be assumed that reading comprehension, teaching methods and the level of self-concept are closely associated to each other. Reading comprehension is a complex process which is produced when a reader is skillful enough. To maintain a student to be a good reader, reciprocal teaching that empowers a reader's skill is needed. Given the implementation of the four strategies, it shapes a reader to be a competent reader.

Reciprocal teaching offers a challenging condition for the student with high self-concept to creatively construct meaning. Besides, it provides students to interact with each other in a friendly way to hold favorable attitudes that contribute to the accomplishment of the student with high self-concept. It also ensures the students to do self-evaluation after reading certain texts. It is appropriate with the students with high self-concept who tend to favor doing self-enhancement. Meanwhile, for the students with poor self-concept are best treated by conventional teaching which ensures them with non-threatening environment.

However, it does not mean that the students with low self-concept cannot absolutely be treated by reciprocal teaching. Reciprocal teaching actually can aid

the students with low self-concept indirectly. A study by Risnawati (2010) found that reciprocal teaching enables the students to develop their ability to solve problem, the ability to communicate which stimulated their logical thinking, and the ability to interact with others. These capabilities produced a positive view of self and made the students confidence which resulted in high self-concept.

Self-concept is of significance to the process of reading. Letting the students possess low self-concept in a massive period will disturb their effort in the reading process and eventually influence their comprehension. Besides, since a meaningful learning is a significant issue to fulfill the students' future demands, the traditional classroom which is highly teacher-based is no longer relevant. Considering these issues, in ensuring that reciprocal teaching is applicable to all students and the use of conventional teaching is reduced, thus, enhancing the students' self-concept is necessitated.

Burns, Roe, and Ross (1996: 17) pointed out several ways to help readers build high self-concept. First, the teacher should assist the students to feel accepted in every possible way. For instance, accept the students' contribution to reading activities even if it is not clearly stated. Second, the teacher provides activities that are simple enough to guarantee satisfactory completion as to help the students feel successful. Third, the teacher should avoid comparing students with peers. But, the reading progress is compared with their prior work.

CONCLUSION

- a. There is a significant difference in reading comprehension between the students who are taught by reciprocal teaching and those by conventional teaching. The students in the experimental group gained higher reading comprehension after being taught by reciprocal teaching than those in the control group after being taught by conventional teaching.
- b. There is an interactional effect between teaching methods and self-concept upon students' reading comprehension.
- c. There is a significant difference in reading comprehension between the students with high self-concept who are taught by reciprocal teaching and

those by conventional teaching. The students with high self-concept who obtained higher comprehension were best treated by reciprocal teaching.

- d. There is a significant difference in reading comprehension between the students with low self-concept who are taught by reciprocal teaching and those by conventional teaching. The students with low self-concept who obtained higher comprehension were best treated by conventional teaching.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- a. It is recommended for EFL teachers to employ a teaching method which emphasizes on cognitive, constructivist and sociocultural view of reading.
- b. It is recommended for the English teachers of grade tenth in SMA Negeri 1 Gianyar to apply reciprocal teaching as an alternative teaching method in reading class.
- c. It is suggested for other researchers to conduct other studies with participants from different levels of learning such as students from primary or junior-high schools, gifted students, students at risk of academic failure, and disabled students. It would be interesting to investigate whether reciprocal teaching would still be beneficial to these other groups and how self-concept level works in them.
- d. It is suggested for other researchers to compare reciprocal teaching to other teaching methods in order to consider which one provides more advantages for the improvement of the English reading comprehension of students.
- e. This study focused on the skill of reading. It would be worth in exploring if reciprocal teaching could be successfully applied to other language skills including listening and speaking. According to the reciprocal teaching processes, when working in groups, the students' roles involve mainly speaking and listening. As a result, it might be beneficial to evaluate whether reciprocal teaching affects students' listening comprehension and speaking ability.
- f. Further studies could focus on teacher training on reciprocal teaching as teachers themselves are one of the main factors in the outcome of teaching. The teachers could be observed and interviewed for their roles in the

classroom, and to monitor the correlation between their role and their learners' improvement.

- g. Given the important presence of self-concept to reading activity, comparisons between students should be avoided. One of the areas where students lose confidence is when they compare themselves to their peers who may have performed better.
- h. Students should be encouraged to develop positive self-concept in learning. It has been noticed that self-concept is influenced by significant others and self-perception. Therefore, to create a positive self-concept, a positive environment/atmosphere must be created and support from others must be enhanced to influence the students' self-perception.

References

- Burns, Paul C., Roe, Betty D., and Ross, Elinor P. 1996. *Teaching Reading: In Today's Elementary School, 6th Ed.* New Jersey: Houghton Mifflin Company.
- Choo, Tan O. L, Eng, Tan K., & Ahmad, N. 2011. Effects of Reciprocal Teaching Strategies on Reading Comprehension. *The Reading Matrix, 11*(2), 140-149. Available at [http://reciprocal/2011/reading matrix](http://reciprocal/2011/reading%20matrix), downloaded on August 5th, 2011.
- Dowson, Martin, Barker, Katrina & McInerney, Dennis M. 2003. The Chicken and the Egg: Causal Ordering of Goals and Self-Concept and Its Effect on Academic Achievement. Available at www.aare.edu.au/03pap/dow03773.pdf, downloaded on April 27th, 2012. (Paper presented at the joint NZARE AARE, Auckland, New Zealand, November 2003).
- Guay, Frederic, March, Herbert W. & Bolvin, Michael. 2003. Academic Self-Concept and Academic Achievement: Development Perspectives on Their Causal Ordering. *Journal of Educational Psychology, 95* (1), 124-136. Available at http://www.motivation.chaire.ulaval.ca/webdav/site/crcmrs/users/admin/public/pdf/publications/2003_academic_achievement.pdf, downloaded on April 27th, 2012.
- Klingner, Janette K., Vaughn, Sharon, and Boardman, Alison. 2007. *Teaching Reading Comprehension to Students with Learning Difficulties*. New York: The Guilford Press.
- Mastiny, Ni Putu Neny. 2011. The Effect of Self-Assessment and Self-Concept on Students' Writing Competency of Grade X Students of SMA Negeri 1 Negara Academic Year 2010/2011. Singaraja: Undiksha. (An Unpublished Thesis).
- Palincsar, Annemarie S. and Brown, Ann L. 1984. Reciprocal Teaching of Comprehension-Fostering and Comprehension-Monitoring Activities. *Cognition and Instruction, 1* (2), 117-175. Available at www.Palincsar_Brown_reciprocal.com, downloaded on August 8th, 2011.
- Rasmiathi, Ni Nyoman Ayu. 2010. Pengaruh Pembelajaran Kooperatif STAD dan Konsep Diri terhadap Prestasi Belajar IPA pada Siswa Kelas VII SMP Negeri 1 Dawan. Singaraja: Undiksha. (An Unpublished Thesis).
- Risnawati, Mila. 2010. Efektivitas Pembelajaran Kooperatif Model *Reciprocal Teaching* terhadap Ketrampilan Berfikir Kritis Siswa pada Pokok Bahasan Struktur dan Fungsi Bagian Tumbuhan pada Siswa Kelas VIIIa MTsN Fillial Popongan, Tegalgondo, Klaten Tahun Pelajaran 2009/2010. Surakarta: Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta. Available at <http://etd.eprints.ums.ac.id/8532/1/A420060013.pdf>, downloaded on July 30th, 2012. (A Published Thesis).
- Westwood, Peter. 2008. *What Teachers Need to Know about Reading and Writing Difficulties*. Victoria: ACER Press.